SOURCEBOOK ON
MEDICAL JURISPRUDENCE
Professor B.M. Dickens
1996/97

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
SOURCEBOOK ON

MEDICAL JURISPRUDENCE

Professor B.M. Dickens

1996/97

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## PART I COURSE OUTLINE

### 1.1

## PART II REFERENCES

### Articles

### 2.2

## PART III TEXTS

1. **Canadian Medical Protective Association: Revenue Statement and Statistical Summary**
   - 3.1
2. **The Medical Malpractice Problem in the United States and Canada**
   - 3.3
3. **Patients' Interests and Clients' Wishes: Physicians and Lawyers in Discord**
   - 3.8
4. **Understanding Variations in What Doctors Do: Globe & Mail, November 22, 1993**
   - 3.16
5. **Legal and Medical Professional Orientations**
   - 3.17
6. **The Prichard Report-Liability and Compensation in Health Care**
   - 3.23
7. **Implications of Health Professionals' Legal Liability**
   - 3.59
8. **The Choice of Contrast Media: Medical, Ethical and Legal Considerations**
   - 3.65
9. **The Modern Law on Informed Consent**
   - 3.69
10. **The Doctrine of "Informed Consent": Informed Choice in Medical Care**
    - 3.74
11. **Liability Concerns about the Implementation of Advance Directives**
    - 3.85
12. **Adolescents and Medical Care Decisions**
    - 3.90
13. **Legal Limits of AIDS Confidentiality**
    - 3.94
14. **Confidentiality and the Duty to Warn**
    - 3.97
15. **From Letting Die to Inducing Death-The Legal Transition**
    - 3.106
16. **Case Comments: Medically Assisted Death: Nancy B v. Hôtel-Dieu de Québec**
    - 3.113
When Terminally Ill Patients Request Death: Assisted Suicide before Canadian Courts 3.131
Research on Human Subjects 3.136
Abortion and Distortion of Justice in the Law 3.142
Legal Evolution of the Concept of Brain Death 3.154
Legal and Ethical Issues in Buying and Selling Organs 3.158
Morals and Markets in Transplantable Organs 3.163
Who Legally Owns and Controls Human Organs after Procurement 3.168
Living Tissue and Organ Donors and Property Law: More on Moore 3.173
Reproduction Law and Medical Consent 3.184
Case Comment: Eve v. E. 3.201
Legal Aspects of the Beginning of Human Life 3.209
Comparative Judicial Embryology: Judges' Approaches to Unborn Human Life 3.217
Legal Issues in Embryo and Fetal Tissue Research and Therapy 3.224
The Ethics of Fetal-tissue Donation: Consensus and Contradiction 3.236
Proceed with Care: Final Report of the Royal Commission on New Reproductive Technologies -- Executive Summary 3.240
Proceed with Care: Media Summary 3.244
Maternal-Fetal Conflict 3.262
Legal Rights and Duties in the AIDS Epidemic 3.267
CPSO Reviews Policy on HIV Infected Physicians 3.274
Managing AIDS Patients 3.278
Some Legal and Ethical Implications of Genetic Predictability 3.283
Legal Issues in Predictive Genetic Testing Programs 3.289
Medical Consent Legislation in Ontario 3.297
Medical Records - Patient's Right to Receive Copies - Physician's Fiduciary Duty of Disclosure 3.307
University of Toronto Centre for Bioethics - Living Will 3.312
A Legal Framework for Health Information: Consultation Paper 3.335

PART IV LEGISLATION

Canada Health Act, Chapter C-6 4.1
Ontario Human Tissue Gift Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. H20 4.8
Health Disciplines Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 196 (excerpt) 4.11
Hospital Management, Regulation 965 of the Public Hospitals Act 4.14
Ontario Bill 108 (1992) (without amendments) 4.22
Health Care Consent Act 1996 4.50
Regulated Health Professions Act (1991) (excerpt) 4.77
Health Professions Procedural Code 4.81
PART I

COURSE OUTLINE

Medical Jurisprudence is offered as a lecture course, but its structure is kept loose in order to accommodate class discussion and/or seminar presentations from interested students. Students are encouraged, but not required, to give seminars; those writing term papers may find it useful to present their work in progress to the rest of the class for comment, perspective and provisional assessment. Evaluation in the course will be based on the term paper (which satisfies the law school's writing requirement), on a final examination or on a take-home assignment, at the student's option. In exceptional circumstances a longer term paper, for three hours' credit, can be arranged.

Students are advised to pay careful initial attention to the lists of recent articles that follow (Part II, infra.). They indicate significant topics addressed in the literature and the thematic dimensions of medical jurisprudence itself, disclosing well-trodden paths still worthy of pursuit, new matters coming to attention and points of interest available for further exploration. The whole list should be read soon after acquisition. It is divided into subject areas, but they are only general and provisional. Most articles affect a number of issues and may be of use in a number of differently directed studies.

A firm sequence of topics to be addressed in class cannot be predetermined; much will depend on the interests of class members and on the subjects chosen for any seminar presentations. The sequence below may, however, serve as a loose model.

- medical negligence and malpractice -- background issues
- malpractice litigation and the law
- informed patient decision-making
- medical treatment of minors
- confidentiality
- the right to die: natural death, non-treatment decisions (defective newborns, severely injured patients, etc.)
- legally protected life, wrongful birth and wrongful life
- criteria for the determination of death: brain death
- medical experimentation
- transplantation law and the control of body materials
- reproduction control, including contraception, sterilization and abortion
- reproduction promotion, including artificial insemination, "test tube" fertilization, surrogate motherhood and embryo transplantation
- acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (AIDS) and HIV infection.
- genetic knowledge: developments, applications and implications
ARTICLES

For convenience, articles are grouped under nine topic headings, but most articles are relevant to two or more headings. A brief definition of the types of articles under each topic heading is provided below. However, reference to a specific subject should not be confined only to one topic heading. Articles preceded by the notation [incl.] are included in these materials.

Topics

1. **Standard of Care and Malpractice**: general articles on medicine and the law; types of liability and duty; who may be liable for malpractice.
2. **Consent**: the modern law of "informed consent; substitute consent; right to refuse treatment (excluding life-saving treatment); rights of minors; experimentation.
3. **Confidentiality**: access to medical records, immunity and privilege.
4. **Right to Die**: right to refuse life-saving treatment; euthanasia.
5. **Mental Health**: rights of the mentally incompetent; substitute consent; involuntary committal and sterilization; behaviour modification; psychiatric damage.
6. **Genetics and Eugenics**: policy proposals and legislation; population policy; "wrongful life" and "wrongful birth" actions.
7. **Time Factors**: Brain death; rights of the unborn; limitation periods; evidence.
8. **Biotechnology**: New reproductive technology; organ transplants; transsexual surgery; new micro-organisms.
9. **Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS)**
I. STANDARD OF CARE AND MALPRACTICE


5. R.J. Basil, "Clergy Malpractice: Taking Spiritual Counselling Conflicts Beyond Intentional Tort Analysis" 19(2) Rutgers Law J. 419-450.


20. T.K. Feng, "Failure of Medical Advice: Trespass or Negligence?" 7(2) Legal Studies 149-168.


40. R.C. Macaulay, Jr., "Health Care Cost Containment and Medical Malpractice: On a Collision Course" 21 Suffolk Univ. Law Rev. 91-118.


69. K. Terrel, "St. Elizabeth Hospital v. Garrard: Case Comment" 29(2) South Texas Law Rev. 461-486.


Standard of Care: 1989/90 Supplement


3. K. Blaner, "Physician, Heal Thyself: Because the Cure, the Health Care Quality Improvement Act, May be worse than the Disease" 37(4) Catholic Univ. Law Rev. (Summer 1988) 1073-1112


**Standard of Care: 1990/91 Supplement**


2.10


Standard of Care: 1991/92 Supplement


2.16


**Standard of Care: 1992/93 Supplement**


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Journal/Volume/Publication</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>D. Callahan</td>
<td>&quot;What is a Reasonable Demand on Health Care Resources? Designing a Basic Package of Benefits&quot;</td>
<td>8 J. Contemporary Health Law &amp; Policy (Spring 1992) 1-12.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


2.20


2.21

60. I.B. Vertinsky and D.A. Wehrung, "Risk Perception and Drug Safety Evaluation" 2(4) Issues in Health & Safety (Fall 1991) 281-311.


Standard of Care: 1993/94 Supplement


8. T.P. Hagen, "'This May Sting A Little' -- A Solution to the Medical Malpractice Crisis Requires Insurers, Doctors, Patients and Lawyers to Take Their Medicine" XXVI(1) Suffolk Univ. L.R. (1992) 147-189.


**Standard of Care: 1994/95 Supplement**


2.27


Standard of Care: 1995/96 Supplement


23. M. Ennis & C. Vincent, "The Effects of Medical Accidents and Litigation on Doctors and Patients" 16(2) Law & Policy 97-121.


2.31


54. A. Leone, "Is ADR the Rx for Malpractice" Dispute Resolution J. (September 1994) 7-21.


77. P.D.G. Skegg, "Omissions to Provide Life-Prolonging Treatment" 8(2) Otago Law Rev. (1994) 205-238.


81. D. Truscott, "The psychotherapist's duty to protect: an annotated bibliography" J. Psychiatry & Law (Summer 1993) 221-244.


Standard of Care: 1996/97 Supplement


42. J. Maurer, "Ohio Psychotherapist Civil Liability For Sexual Relations With Former Patients" 26(3) Univ. of Toledo L. Rev. (547-574).


55. Reidinger, "Fraud Doctors A Revitalized False Claims Act is Proving to be a New Weapon for Health-Care Employees Who Blow the Whistle on Rip-Offs" ABA Journal (May 1996) 50-54.


2.38


II. CONSENT


Consent: 1989/90 Supplement


15. C. Kazin, "'Nowhere to Go and Choose to Stay': Using the Tort of False Imprisonment To Redress Involuntary Confinement of the Elderly in Nursing Homes and Hospitals" 137 (3) Univ. of Penn. Law Rev. (Jan. 1989) 903-927.


**Consent: 1990/91 Supplement**


**Consent: 1991/92 Supplement**


32. D.M. Oyler, "Interspousal Tort Liability for Infliction of a Sexually Transmitted Disease" 29(2) J. Family Law (1990/91) 519-537.


Consent: 1992/93 Supplement


11. J. Eekelaar, "The Importance of Thinking that Children Have Rights" 6(1) Int'l J. of Law and the Family (1992) 221-244.


Consent: 1993/94 Supplement


5. B.M. Dickens, Human Rights in Medical Experimentation" in General Problems of Human Rights ??


Consent: 1994/95 Supplement


28. Laura M. Plastine, "'In God We Trust': When Parents Refuse Medical Treatment for their Children Based Upon Their Sincere Religious Beliefs" 3(1) Constitutional L.J. (1993) 123-160.
2.56


Consent: 1995/96 Supplement


2.57


Consent: 1996/97 Supplement


2.61


III. **CONFIDENTIALITY**


11. B.S. Murphy, B.S., "How to Protect Employees Who are Tested for Drug and Alcohol Abuse" 33(1) The Practical Lawyer 27-40.


Confidentiality: 1989/90 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1990/91 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1991/92 Supplement


5. R. Slovenko, "The Therapist's Duty to Warn or Protect Third Persons" J. Psychiatry & Law (Spring 1988) 139-209.


Confidentiality: 1992/93 Supplement

2.66


Confidentiality: 1993/94 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1994/95 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1995/96 Supplement


2.68


Confidentiality: 1996/97 Supplement


8. J. Krent, "Of Diaries and Data Banks: Use Restrictions Under the Fourth Amendment" 74 Texas L. Rev. 49-100.


IV. **RIGHT TO DIE**


2.72


Right to Die: 1989/90 Supplement


Right to Die: 1990/91 Supplement


15. N. Hentoff, "The Church, the Law, and the Advancing Armies of Death" 33(1) Catholic Lawyer 1-11.


2.76


**Right to Die: 1991/92 Supplement**


2.79


Right to Die: 1992/93 Supplement


25. Y. Kamisar, "When is there a Constitutional 'Right to Die'? When there is No Constitutional 'Right to Live'?" 25(5) Georgia Law Rev. (Summer 1991) 1203-1242.


27. J. Kevorkian, "A Fail-Safe Model for Justifiable Medically-Assisted Suicide ('Medicide')" 13(1) Amer. J. of Forensic Psychiatry (1992) 7-41. (Commentaries on Dr. Kevorkian's Article infra, 43-81.)


Right to Die: 1993/94 Supplement


2.84


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Journal/Issue/Publication Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
57. J.A. Zina., "Assisted Suicide: Society's Response to a Plea for Relief or a Simple Solution to the Cries of the Needy?" 23(2) Rutgers L.J. (1992) 387-408.

Right to Die: 1994/95 Supplement


**Right to Die: 1995/96 Supplement**


19. D. Morgan, "Odysseus and the binding directive: only a cautionary tale?" 14(3) Legal Studies 411-42.
2.91


Right to Die: 1996/97 Supplement


35. Sanchez, "Your Will Be Done?" 23(1) Barrister (1996) 6-10.


V. MENTAL HEALTH


Mental Health: 1989/90 Supplement


Mental Health: 1990/91 Supplement


**Mental Health: 1991/92 Supplement**


2.101


Mental Health: 1992/93 Supplement


Mental Health: 1993/94 Supplement


2.105

Mental Health: 1994/95 Supplement


2.106


Mental Health: 1995/96 Supplement


2. A.R. Callahan, "Will the 'Real'Battered Woman Please Stand Up? In Search of a Realistic Legal Definition of Battered Woman Syndrome" 3 J. Gender & the Law (1994) 117-52.


Mental Health: 1996/97 Supplement


VI. GENETICS AND EUGENICS


Genetics and Eugenics: 1989/90 Supplement


30. R. Macklin, "Is There Anything Wrong with Surrogate Motherhood?: An Ethical Analysis" 16(1-2) Law, Med. & Health Care (1988) 57-64.


Genetics and Eugenics: 1990/91 Supplement


**Genetics and Eugenics: 1991/92 Supplement**


2.117


2.118


Genetics and Eugenics: 1992/93 Supplement


2. R. Boland, "Recent Developments in Abortion Law in Industrialized Countries" 18(4) Law, Med. & Health Care (Winter 1990) 404-418.


Genetics and Eugenics: 1993/94 Supplement


Genetics and Eugenics: 1994/95 Supplement


Genetics and Eugenics: 1995/96 Supplement


24. P. Mostow, "'Like Building on Top of Auschwitz': On the Symbolic Meaning of Using Data from the Nazi Experiments, and on Non-use as a Form of Memorial" 10(2) J. Law & Religion 403-31.


**Genetics and Eugenics: 1996/97 Supplement**


2.127


VII. TIME FACTORS


5. V.L. Bor, "Fetal Protection Policies & Title VII" 2(4) The Labor Lawyer 683-693.


2.129


26. C. Overall, "Pluck a Fetus from its Womb: A Critique of Current Attitudes Toward the Embryo/Fetus" 84(1) Univ. of Western Ont. Law Rev. 1-14.


2.130


Time Factors: 1989/90 Supplement


Time Factors: 1990/91 Supplement


2.133


2.134


**Time Factors: 1991/92 Supplement**


49. C.L. Neff, "Woman, Womb and Bodily Integrity" 3(2) Yale J. Law & Feminism" (1991) 327-353.


Time Factors: 1992/93 Supplement


**Time Factors: 1993/94 Supplement**


Time Factors: 1994/95 Supplement


Time Factors: 1995/96 Supplement


Time Factors: 1996/97 Supplement


VIII. BIOTECHNOLOGY


10. R.S. Eisenberg, "Proprietary Rights and the Norms of Science in Biotechnology Research" 97(2) Yale Law J. 177-231.


33. J. Taitz, "The Law Relating to the Consummation of Marriage where one of the Spouses is a Post Operative Transsexual" 15(2) Anglo-American Law Rev. 141-149.


Biotechnology: 1989/90 Supplement


Biotechnology: 1990/91 Supplement


**Biotechnology: 1991/92 Supplement**


Biotechnology: 1992/93 Supplement

2.158


2.160


53. J. Swaigen, "Negligence, Reverse Onuses and Environmental Offences: Some Practical Considerations" 2(2) J. of Environmental Law & Practice 149-188.


Biotechnology: 1993/94 Supplement


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Journal, Volume(No)</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Page(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>M. Berer</td>
<td>&quot;Inducing a Miscarriage&quot;: Women-Centred Perspectives on RU486/Prostaglandin as an Early Abortion Method</td>
<td>L., Med. and Health Care (1992)</td>
<td>20(3)</td>
<td>199-208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>B.M. Dickens</td>
<td>&quot;Legal Issues Pertaining to the Role of the Family in Organ Retrieval&quot;</td>
<td>Transplantation Today (Feb. 1985)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4-7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>B.M. Dickens</td>
<td>&quot;Control of Excised Tissue Pending Implantation&quot;</td>
<td>Transplantation/Implantation Today (Feb. 1990)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>36-41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


37. A. Wertheimer, "Two Questions about Surrogacy and Exploitation" 21(3) Phil. and Pub. Affairs 211-239.


Biotechnology: 1994/95 Supplement


2.166


Biotechnology: 1995/96 Supplement


2. N.M.C. Bell, "Regulating transfer and use of fetal tissue in transplantation procedures: The ethical dimensions" 20 American J. Law & Medicine (1994) 277-94.


2.170


2.172


Biotechnology: 1996/97 Supplement


14. Dresser, 1 And Baby Makes Three...or Four...or Five: Assisted Reproduction! 31(12) Trial (December 1995) 29-33.


2.175


IX. ACQUIRED IMMUNODEFICIENCY SYNDROME (AIDS)


2.180


**Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1989/90 Supplement**


2.181


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1990/91 Supplement


**Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1991/92 Supplement**


13. M.S. Cecere, "Working with AIDS" 16(4) Brief (Summer 1987) 6-42.


2.187


46. L.A. Polito, "Containing the AIDS Virus... Testing... Reporting... Confidentiality... Constitutional Considerations" 37(2) Cleveland State Law Rev. (1990) 369-392.


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1992/93 Supplement


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1993/94 Supplement


**Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1994/95 Supplement**


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1995/96 Supplement


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1996/97 Supplement


22. Perrin, "The Catch-22 for Persons With AIDS: To Have or Not To Have Easy Access To Experimental Therapies and Early Approval for New Drugs" 69(1) Southern California L. R. 105-153.


